P.O. Box 11145 Tempe, AZ 85284 www.nativeamericanbar.org facebook.com/NationalNABA twitter.com/@NationalNABA



President, Thomasina Real Bird
Immediate Past President,
Robert Saunooke
Secretary, Katie Jones
Treasurer, Phil Brodeen

Directors:
Bree Black Horse
Debra Gee
Colleen Lamarre
Geneva Thompson
Lauren van Schilfgaarde
Carolyn West

June 26, 2020

The Center for Women in Law

<u>Veronica.Stidvent@law.utexas.edu</u>

Executive Committee

The NALP Foundation

FHornblower@nalpfoundation.org
JMandery@nalpfoundation.org
Board of Trustees
National Advisory Board

Re: Exclusion of Native American Women Law Students from "Women in Color – Law School Experiences" Study

Dear Organization Officers:

On Wednesday, June 15, 2020, The Center for Women in Law (CWIL) and The NALP Foundation (NALP) issued a national press release on the publication of their newly released "Women of Color - Law School Experiences" study. The study is described as a "first-of-its-kind report detailing the educational and social experiences of women of color in law school across the country." In the press release, the women of color responses analyzed in the study were set forth as follows: "Asian/Pacific Islander, Black/African-American and Hispanic women/Latinas comprised the majority of the women of color respondents." Glaringly absent from this list are Native American/American Indian/Alaska Native women of color. When reviewing the study, numerous charts, illustrations and qualitative responses are set forth and all fail to include Native American women of color. This failure reflects an ongoing issue in the legal profession to undervalue and exclude Native American voices.

National Native American Bar Association (NNABA) leadership, Native American law professors, and other supporters have identified numerous issues with the study and expressed their concerns to NALP and the CWIL during a conversation on June 19, 2020.

The concerns fall into four categories.

- 1. Invisibility of Native law students in the study;
- 2. Lack of Native Americans in the Planning of the study;
- 3. Flaws in the Methodology of the study; and
- 4. Misrepresentations in the study.
- 1. Invisibility of Natives in the study It is NNABA's position that the survey serves to further legitimize the exclusion of Native Americans in studies about Native Americans in the legal profession. The study only includes Native Americans in the aggregate data and excludes Native Americans from the executive summary and the descriptive part of the report. This omission contributes to the marginalization of Native Americans and perpetuates 500 years of genocide and inequity. It also sends a message to current and future Native American law students that they are not a part of the future of the

NNABA – NALP and CWIL June 26, 2020 Page 2 of 8

legal profession. The harm will likely also negatively affect the careers of current and future Native American women lawyers.

- 2. Lack of Native Americans in the Planning of the study The study contains a list of about 40 advisors and, to the best of our knowledge, not one is Native American. With so many advisors and not having one as Native, seems to make clear that Natives were not even included in the planning of the study. And, if even one Native American had been included, it is almost certain that Native law students would have been fully included in the study. For hundreds of years, Native Americans have often not had a seat at the table and have had decisions made for them, and, unfortunately, this study perpetuates this long history
- 3. Flaws in the Methodology of the study The study's design was flawed and did not attempt to secure voices of all women of color. Despite the omission of one of the core groups of women of color, the report reads like it is a representative and generalizable study of the experiences of women of color. The report is not generalizable or representative. The report describes the experiences of only Hispanic/Latina, Black/African American, and Asian/Pacific Islander law students at 46 law schools during one academic year (2017-18). The methodology allowed for schools and its students to selfselect and included no effort to obtain a representative sample. Also, there was not a particular number of responses that was set as a goal for the study - rather, the study was concluded when you felt that you had reached a big response. It was stated that this is the methodology that NALP uses for all its studies which reveals a problem beyond this study. The report, however, does not explain the limits of its findings or even transparently explain the research design and methodology used to collect the data it reports. Native American researchers, many of who are empiricists, noted the study has serious methodological flaws, including the use of a convenience sample based on self-selecting participants rather than a research design structured to target women of color and ensure their participation, a sample size too small to say anything useful about Native women, and the use of statistical analyses without any discussion of the racial biases inherent in them.

There was no effort to do any concerted outreach for particularly underserved populations, including targeting schools with Indian programs or circulating the study to national affinity groups such as the National Native American Law Students Association. Further, even with the low response rate from Native Americans, aggregate data and analysis could have included a Native American perspective. Study authors informed us that they could not aggregate the data because of confidentiality concerns and the IRB requirements. However, since the law schools were not listed, there is no risk of breaking any confidentiality or identifying who produced the response, If the study authors were truly committed to getting a diverse pool, they could have reached out to Native American programs to secure sufficient Native American responses in the aggregate data. Yet the report fails to acknowledge these problems and how they have led to a serious informational bias (the exclusion of Native American women).

4. Misrepresentations in the Title of the study – Since the study essentially bills itself as a study of all female law students of color, our position is that is a misrepresentation since Native Americans are essentially excluded. Approximately 4,000 students from 46 of 203 law schools participated in the study through self-selection. Because the Native American voice is missing, the study cannot continue to claim that it is truly a study of all women of color across the country.

As a result of these concerns, NNABA is requesting that the study be withdrawn and redone so that Natives can be included in a meaningful way. NNABA and multiple Native American and non-native

NNABA – NALP and CWIL June 26, 2020 Page **3** of **8**

law professors have offered to assist in the outreach to Native American women law students to serve as study participants. If you are not willing to withdraw and redo the study to include Native American women law students, we request an apology for the omission of Native American women law students from the report and would call for the attachment of the apology to the study permanently on the web site locations where it is housed as well as a distribution of the apology in a news release to the same entities that were sent the June 17, 2020 news release.

Unfortunately, after preliminary outreach, NALP and CWIL have stated that they would not withdraw the study but would try to provide some clarifications and note the lack of responses from Native law students. NNABA and its supporters believe that at the very least this type of clarification would be inadequate, and it could even make the situation worse. Indeed, the language added after the June 19th conversation has led to a distrust of your organizations for failing to consult.

NNABA hopes that there can be a continuing dialogue to try to reach some outcome where the vibrancy and perspectives of Native American law students are fully included in this research. We believe that the voices of Native Americans matter and that these systemic exclusions continue to perpetuate harm in both the profession and our pipeline. We hope that by identifying the problems with this study that you can join us in advancing all women of color, including Native American women, in the profession. We appreciate your consideration of this request.

Sincerely,

Thomasina Real Bird	Lauren van Schilfgaarde
Ihanktonwan Nakota, Sicangu Lakota	Cochiti Pueblo
President, 2020-2021	Board Member
National Native American Bar Association	National Native American Bar Association
Founding Partner	Tribal Legal Development Clinic Director
Patterson Earnhart Real Bird & Wilson LLP	UCLA School of Law
Email: trealbird@nativelawgroup.com	Email: vanschilfgaarde@law.ucla.edu
Paulene Abeyta	Geneva E. B. Thompson
Navajo Nation	Cherokee Nation
President	Board Member
National Native American Law Students	Young Lawyers Committee Chair
Association	National Native American Bar Association
Email: nnalsa.president@gmail.com	Email: gebthompson@gmail.com
Colleen Lamarre	Katie Jones
Mohawk	Cherokee Nation
Board Member	Board Member
National Native American Bar Association	National Native American Bar Association
Email: colleen.lamarre@pillsburylaw.com	Email: ktjones@gmail.com

Mary Smith Cherokee Nation Past President, NNABA Vice Chair, VENG Group Email: marysmith828@hotmail.com Patty Ferguson-Bohnee Pointe-au-Chien	Irene Oria National President Hispanic National Bar Association Email: president@hnba.com Susan Allen Rosebud Sioux Tribe
Pointe-au-Chien Past President, NNABA Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law, Arizona State University Email: pafergus@asu.edu	Attorney Email: susan_allen@live.com
Lawrence R. Baca Pawnee Past President, NNABA Email: lawrence.baca@yahoo.com	Swethaa S. Ballakrishnen Assistant Professor of Law University of California Irvine Email: sballakrishnen@law.uci.edu
Joel West Williams Cherokee Nation Past President, NNABA Email: williams@narf.org	Ahtza Chavez Diné & Kewa Pueblo Treasurer NALSA UNM School of Law Email: chavezol@law.unm.edu
John Echohawk Pawnee Executive Director Native American Rights Fund Email: jechohwk@narf.org	Grant Christensen Associate Professor of Law Director of the UND Indian Law Program University of North Dakota Email: grant.t.christensen@und.edu
Jerry Gardner Cherokee Executive Director Tribal Law and Policy Institute NNABA Delegate to ABA House of Delegates Email: jerry@tlpi.org	Richard Collins Professor University of Colorado Email: richard.collins@colorado.edu
Rose Petoskey Grand Traverse Band of Ottawa and Chippewa Indians President, 2020-2021 Native American Bar Association of Washington, DC Email: rose.petoskey@dentons.com	Sarah Deer Mvskoke University Distinguished Professor University of Kansas Email: sarah.deer@ku.edu

Cara DiMare Email: cara.dimare@sittingbull.edu	James Grijalva Friedman Professor of Law University of North Dakota School of Law Email: james.grijalva@und.edu
Angelique EagleWoman Sisseton-Wahpeton Dakota Oyate Visiting Professor Mitchell Hamline School of Law Email: Angelique.EagleWoman@mitchellhamline.edu	Catherine Grosso Professor Michigan State University College of Law Email: grosso@law.msu.edu
Eric D. Eberhard Affiliate Assistant Professor of Law University of Washington School of Law Email: ee23@uw.edu	Jacqueline Hand Professor University of Detroit Mercy Law School Email: handjp@udmercy.edu
Joshua Fershee Dean and Professor of Law Creighton University School of Law Email: JoshuaFershee@creighton.edu	Alia Hawkins Eastern Band of Cherokee Email: alia.hawkins@mitchellhamline.edu
Matthew Fletcher Grand Traverse Band of Ottawa and Chippewa Indians Professor Michigan State University College of Law Email: matthew.fletcher@law.msu.edu	Dylan R. Hedden-Nicely Cherokee Nation Associate Professor University of Idaho, College of Law Email: dhedden@uidaho.edu
Carla Fredericks Mandan Hidatsa Arikara Nation Clinical Professor University of Colorado Law School Email: carla.fredericks@colorado.edu	Kysa Huddleston Email: kysa.huddleston@mitchellhamline.edu
Gabriel S. Galanda Round Valley Indian Tribes of California Former Board Member, NNABA Attorney Galanda Broadman, PLLC Email: gabe@galandabroadman.com	Esther Jamison Tribal Law Journal Email: jamisoes@law.unm.edu
Julia A. Giffin Sac and Fox Nation Email: jag565@cornell.edu	Jerrod Johnson Creek JD Candidate Mitchell Hamline School of Law Email: jerrod.johnson@mitchellhamline.edu

José Roberto Juárez, Jr. Professor of Law University of Denver Sturm College of Law Email: bjuarez@law.du.edu	Jessica Martinez Chihene Nde Nation of New Mexico (Apache) Editor-in-Chief Tribal Law Journal Email: martinjes@law.unm.edu
Sarah Krakoff Moses Lasky Professor of Law University of Colorado Law School Email: Sarah.Krakoff@colorado.edu	Dr. Kirsten Matoy Carlson Associate Professor of Law Wayne State University Email: kirsten.carlson@wayne.edu
Elizabeth Kronk Warner Sault Ste. Marie Tribe of Chippewa Indians Dean, S.J. Quinney College of Law University of Utah Email: elizabeth.warner@law.utah.edu	Robert J. Miller Eastern Shawnee Professor Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law Arizona State University Email: robert.j.miller@asu.edu
Stacy Leeds Cherokee Nation Dean Emeritus and Professor of Law University of Arkansas Email: leeds@me.com	Monte Mills Associate Professor Director of Margery Hunter Brown Indian Law Clinic Alexander Blewett III School of Law University of Montana Email: monte.mills@umontana.edu
Dan Lewerenz Iowa Tribe of Kansas and Nebraska Staff Attorney Native American Rights Fund Email: lewerenz@narf.org	Richard A. Monette Turtle Mountain Band of Chippewa Professor University of Wisconsin Law School Email: richard.monette@wisc.edu
Vicki J. Limas The University of Tulsa College of Law Email: vicki-limas@utulsa.edu	Steven Moore Senior Staff Attorney Native American Rights Fund Email: smoore@narf.org
Kevin Maillard Seminole Nation Professor of Law Syracuse University Email: maillard@syr.edu	Makalika Destarte Naholowaa Native Hawaiian Policy Committee Chair, National Native American Bar Association Chief of Staff to the General Counsel and Assistant General Counsel, Microsoft Corporation Email: manah@microsoft.com

Michael Oeser	Leah Sixkiller
Cherokee Nation	Red Lake Band of Chippewa Indians
Associate Professor	Associate
Senior Fellow, SULC NALPI	Faegre Drinker Biddle & Reath
Southern University Law Center	Email: leah.sixkiller@faegredrinker.com
Email: moeser@sulc.edu	
Brooke Pinkham	Alex Skibine
Nez Perce	Osage Nation
Director	Professor
Center for Indian Law and Policy	University of Utah College of Law
Email: pinkhamb@seattleu.edu	Email: alexander.skibine@law.utah.edu
Pintair. pintairioto/scattica.caa	Email: diexander.skrome(w)taw.dtan.eda
Kristen Polk	Max Spivak
San Carlos Apache Tribe	Submissions Editor
Events & Outreach Editor	Tribal Law Journal
Tribal Law Journal	Email: spivakma@law.unm.edu
Email: polkkr@law.unm.edu	
P 5 111 (1)/25 11 (1)	
Trevor Reed	Michalyn Steele
Hopi	Seneca Nation
Associate Professor of Law	Francis R. Kirkham Professor of Law
Arizona State University	BYU Law
Email: trevor.g.reed@gmail.com	Email: steelem@law.byu.edu
Zinan. <u>acvorgneed(e)gman.com</u>	Elitaii. <u>steetelii(e/tavio) aleaa</u>
Collette Routel	Victoria Sutton
Professor of Law	Lumbee
Co-Director of Indian Law Program	Associate Dean for Digital Learning and Graduate
Mitchell Hamline School of Law	Education
Email: colette.routel@mitchellhamline.edu	Paul Whitfield Horn Professor
Billian. <u>Gototte (Griffite International and International Andreas (International Andreas (Internationa) (International Andreas (Internationa) (Internationa) (Intern</u>	Texas Tech University School of Law
	Email: vickie.sutton@ttu.edu
	Dillan. Vickie.Suttonfortu.edu
Sudha Setty	Heather Tanana
Dean and Professor of Law	Navajo
Western New England University School of Law	Assistant Professor of Law (Research)
Email: sudha.setty@law.wne.edu	S.J. Quinney College of Law
Direction of the control of the cont	University of Utah
	Email: tananah@law.utah.edu
	Linan. tananan@iaw.utan.euu
Gregory Silverman	Melissa L. Tatum
Mohegan Tribe of Indians of Connecticut	Research Professor of Law
Associate Professor of Law	University of Arizona
Faculty Director, Center for Indian Law and Policy	Email: mtatum@arizona.edu
Seattle University School of Law	Tanan. Intatuniwanzona.cuu
Email: gmsilver@seattleu.edu	
Eman. gmsnven@seameu.edu	

Sherri Nicole Thomas Taos Pueblo Associate Dean of Institutional Culture and Equity University of New Mexico School of Law Email: thomas@law.unm.edu	Robert A. Williams, Jr. Lumbee Tribe of North Carolina Regents Professor Faculty Co-Chair of the Indigenous Peoples Law and Policy Program The University of Arizona Email: lumbee@arizona.edu
Ann Tweedy Associate Professor University of South Dakota Email: ann.tweedy@usd.edu	Verna Williams Dean and Nippert Professor of Law University of Cincinnati College of Law Email: verna.williams@uc.edu
Gloria Valencia-Weber Mexican Indigenous Emerita Professor University of New Mexico School of Law	Marcia Zug Professor of Law University of South Carolina School of Law Email: zug@law.sc.edu
Jack F. Williams Professor Georgia State University College of Law Email: jwilliams@gsu.edu	